UH Bridge to Hope: Bridging Data Outcomes and Program Goals

Teresa Bill
UH Systemwide Coordinator, Bridge to Hope

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
UH Bridge to Hope
All 10 UH Campuses

• Provide Access to Higher Education as a Means to Economic Self-Sufficiency

• Established Legislatively July 2000
  – In response to Community pressure and activism to re-establish college access for “welfare participants”
  – A partnership between State Dept. Human Services & UH
  – 1995 Federal Welfare (de)Reform Act “re-inventing welfare” requires:
    • “Work activities” (20-35 hours per week)
    • Lifetime limit 60 months = 5yrs “Temporary”/TANF
  – 2006 Add’l Federal Rules Limiting State Options Reduces BTH Participation

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
UH Bridge to Hope
All 10 UH Campuses

• Pilot Project Begins  Fall 2000-Spring 2001 – 0 Staff
  – AY2001-2003 .5 fte Staff
  – AY2004 - Currently – 1 fte Staff & 9 Volunteer “Campus Contacts”

• F‘2007 – 1st Participant Survey
  – 400 Participants; Respondents: 50/50 Current & Former

• F‘2010 data – (10 Year Summary)

• F‘2015 – Partner w/ DataExchange &UH IRAO

• Spring 2016 – to be launched

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
Program Goal & Functions

- Provide access to higher education as a means to economic self-sufficiency
- Provide on-campus employment for students;
  - Time Management
  - Supportive Academic Worksite
- Provide referrals to academic support services at UH;
- Assist client students’ understanding and fulfilling of DHS/First-to-Work (FTW) requirements;
- Facilitate consistent implementation of FTW Education policies and UH-DHS Agency communication re: student clients;
- Develop Student Self-advocacy skills

[www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope]
Key Questions re: Education

• Do Bridge to Hope Participants –
  – Persist,
  – Make Academic Progress &
  – Earn Degrees?
  • (Eventually, if not during Program Eligibility)

• Do Bridge to Hope program elements assist in that success?

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
Key Questions re: Earnings

• Do BTH Participants earn more and/or gain more stable/better employment due to college enrollment/graduation...
  – Than if they had not attended college & instead participated full-time in paid/volunteer employment (typically minimal wages)

• What are BTH participants earning?
• Where are they working?
• Does investment in education for FTW clients pay off?
Previous Data - STAR

• Track Degree Achievement thru STAR

Between Fall 2000 – Fall 2007, 401 Participants (with 104 still enrolled) earned:

Degrees Completed as of Fall 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree Type</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AA/AS</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(43 continued to BA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA/BS</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA/Professional Degree</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>224</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Still Enrolled</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Previous Data - Surveys

• Fall 2007 – 1st Participant Survey
  – 400 Participants, 137 Surveys Completed
    • (37% of contacted; 34% of total participants)
  – 50/50 Current & Former
  – 75% Participated at CCs
  – Earnings & Benefits self-reported (small #s)

• Fall 2010 Survey – (10 Year Summary)
  – 494 Participants-to-date, 133 Surveys Completed
  – Earnings & Benefits self-reported

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
# National Comparison of Wages & Benefits¹ of Women Leaving Welfare:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Wages Hourly</th>
<th>Employer Health Insur.</th>
<th>Paid Vacation / Sick Leave</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maine Parents As Scholars Graduates (BA) (2006 Earnings) (Supports BA education)</td>
<td>$14.31 inflation adj = $15.48</td>
<td>94.7%</td>
<td>90% / 84%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UH Bridge to Hope Participants (Supports AA/BA education) (2010)</td>
<td>$20.70</td>
<td>73.0%</td>
<td>65% / 73%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Wages for all BTH participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education Level</th>
<th>Salary (annual)</th>
<th>Wages (hourly)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Degree not completed</td>
<td>$23,291</td>
<td>$14.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed AA/AS (2yr)</td>
<td>$33,702</td>
<td>$18.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completed BA/BS (4yr)</td>
<td>$40,290</td>
<td>$23.92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Source: Various studies and reports.
Program Persistence: Keep Asking . . .

• Aware DHHS & MDRC Researchers report using UI (Unemployment Insurance) data as proxy for “earnings”
  – TANF Block Grant funding Gives States:
    • No incentive & $0 to track “welfare leavers”
    • Focus on Eligibility & Direct Client Expenditures (HI)
  – Useful for Inter-State Wage-Earners (“leavers”)
  – Used for Child Support Enforcement
• Unavail. in Hawaiʻi – until (?) Recently
• BTH connects with DXP Summer 2015

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
Data Pathways

Using Unemployment Insur. as Proxy for Earnings. . .

• Do BTH participants achieve increased earnings with AA/BA degrees?
  – Compared with “welfare leavers”

• What kind of earnings do BTH Participants achieve?

• Do they earn enough to achieve self-sufficiency or reduce public benefit use?

Using UH IRAO and NSC data. . .

• Do BTH participants achieve degree completion?

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
BTH Degree Completion Project w/ IRAO & DXP

• BTH shares participant UH ID & varied Demographics
  – Single parent/2parents status, Age of youngest child, etc.
  – 2007 Survey Data (Institute BTH New Participant Form)

• UH Institutional Research & Analysis Office (IRAO) Queries:
  – Ethnicity, DOB, SSN
  – Degree completion (or last enrollment @UH)
  – Degree completion or last enrollment in NSC (Natʻl Student Clearinghouse)
  – Matches UH ID w/SSN

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
BTH Earnings Project w/ DXP

- BTH shares participant UH ID & varied Demographics
- UH IRAO Queries:
  - Matches UH ID w/SSN
  - FEDES for any HI-based federal employee qtrly earning
- IRAO Shares Files w/ DXP
- DXP Queries HI Dept of Labor Unemployment Insurance Data
  - UI Data Set begins 2006
  - 2006-2010 Cohort w/ 5 Years Employment Records

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
New Data Set – IRAO & National Student Clearinghouse

- IRAO Matches UH ID with National Student Clearinghouse Data
  - Find 51 Add’l Degrees

**BRIDGE TO HOPE, UH DEGREE COMPLETION**

- UH Certificate: 77 (10%)
- UH Associate's: 157 (21%)
- UH Bachelor's: 124 (16%)
- UH Post-Bac: 47 (6%)
- UH ADV Degree: 51 (7%)
- NO Degree: 298 (40%)

- 54% earned a degree or certificate from UH
- 60% earned a degree or certificate
New Data Set – IRAO & NSC

DXP Analyzes IRAO & NSC Data To Determine Degree Completion Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BTH ENTRY TERM DEGREE LEVEL</th>
<th>PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>NOT ENROLLED FALL 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NBR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERTIFICATE</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASSOCIATE</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BACHELOR’S</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POST-BAC/GRAD CERT</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADVANCED DEGREE</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>754</td>
<td>572</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Highest Degree Completion

DEGREE/CERTIFICATE EARNED

- Associate's, 41%
- Bachelor's, 34%
- Post-Bac or Advanced, 15%
- Certificate, 10%
BTH Participant Ethnicity & Race
UH IRAO Definitions

- 51.3% Native Hawaiian
- 14.5% Pacific Islander
- 5.3% African American
- 5.3% Asian (not Filipino)
- 13.2% Hispanic
- 6.3% Multiple
- 4.3% AmIndian/Hispanic

Legend:
- Red: AfrAm/AmIndian/Hispanic
- Orange: Asian (not Filipino)
- Yellow: Filipino
- Green: Multiple
- Blue: Native Hawaiian
- Dark Blue: Pacific Islander
- Dark Purple: White
BTH Entry Campus 2010 – 2015
Native Hawaiian Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Home Campus</th>
<th>Number BTH Entrants</th>
<th>Percent Native Hawaiian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UH Manoa</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UH Hilo</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UH West Oahu</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii CC</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honolulu CC</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kapiolani CC</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kauai CC</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leeward CC</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maui College</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Windward CC</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BTH ENTRY HOME CAMPUS

- Number BTH Entrants
- Percent Native Hawaiian
BTH vs. UH Degree Completion 150% (6Yr)

- UH Manoa: 63%
- UH Hilo: 44%
- UH West Oahu: 36%
- UH Four Years: 48%
- UH Community Colleges: 35%
- Hawaii CC: 34%
- Honolulu CC: 36%
- Kapiolani CC: 36%
- Kauai CC: 40%
- Leeward CC: 32%
- Maui College: 35%
- Windward CC: 31%

% BTH ENTRY HOME CAMPUS

Degree Completion
BTH Earnings Project w/ DXP

- BTH shares participant UH ID & varied Demographics
- UH IRAO Queries:
  - Matches UH ID w/SSN
  - FEDES for any HI-based federal employee qtrly earning
- IRAO Shares Files w/ DXP
- DXP Queries HI Dept of Labor Unemployment Insurance Data
- Shares Analysis with Aggregate Findings
- UI Data Set begins 2006
  - 2006-2010 Cohort w/ 5 Years Employment Records
  - Earlier BTH Participants appear in 2006-on

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
Limits of UI as Earnings Proxy

• Excludes:
  – “Self-Insurers” for Unemployment Insurance
    • (larger employers)
  – Self-Employed – Hawaii women highly engaged
    • (9% of HI female workers; 31% of HI small biz)
  – Total $ Earnings Cannot determine
    • If earnings for full-time/part-time
    • Hired at end of Qtr
    • Household earnings, only individual earnings
    • “under the table” / undeclared income
  – Graduates working in other States (out migration)

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
AY06-10 (Cohort)
% Working All 4 Qtrs
(Recession: 2007-2010)

PERCENT FOUND WORKING ALL 4 QUARTERS
YR1 – YR5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2010. Not enrolled Fall 2015.
AY06-10 % Working All 4 Qtrs – By Degree
(Recession: 2007-2010)

PERCENT FOUND WORKING ALL 4 QUARTERS
YR1 – YR5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2010. Not enrolled Fall 2015.

- ANY DEGREE/CERT
- ASSOCIATE
- BACHELOR & P.B.
- NO DEGREE/CERT
YEAR 1 WAGE (Everyone) After Last Award or Enrollment

WAGES YEAR 1 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2014.
Not enrolled Fall 2015. Only includes those with at least one qtr of wages.

NO DEGREE/CERT
Median: $10,345
n=93

ANY DEGREE/CERT
Median: $26,092
n=190
YEAR 1 WAGE (Everyone) By Degree Type

WAGES YEAR 1 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2014.
Not enrolled Fall 2015. Only includes those with at least one qtr of wages.

n=93  n=190  n=61  n=78
YEAR 3 WAGE

WAGES YEAR 3 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2004 and AY2012.
Not enrolled Fall 2015. Only includes those with at least one qtr of wages.

Median: $19,101
Median: $32,733

n=62
n=138
YEAR 5 WAGE(Everyone) After Last Award or Enrollment

WAGES YEAR 5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2002 and AY2010.
Not enrolled Fall 2015. Only includes those with at least one qtr of wages.

NO DEGREE/CERT
Median: $17,832
n=53

ANY DEGREE/CERT
Median: $34,609
n=108
YEAR 5 WAGE (Everyone) By Degree Type

WAGES YEAR 5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2002 and AY2010.
Not enrolled Fall 2015. Only includes those with at least one qtr of wages.

No Degree/Cert: n=53
Any Degree/Cert: n=108
Associate: n=36
Bachelor & P.B.: n=49
AY06-10 Cohort Earnings
(incl. advanced degrees)

MEDIAN WAGE, YR1 - YR5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2010. Not enrolled Fall 2015.

Only includes those with at least one quarter of wages in each year.
AY06-10 Cohort
(Excluding advanced degrees)

MEDIAN WAGE, YR1 - YR5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT

Only includes those with at least one quarter of wages in each year.
AY06-10 (By degree level)

MEDIAN WAGE, YR1 - YR5 AFTER LAST AWARD OR ENROLLMENT
Last award/enrollment between AY2006 and AY2010. Not enrolled Fall 2015.

Only includes those with at least one quarter of wages in each year.
New Questions, New Directions

• Not aware how large % of Native Hawaiian participants
  – Increase Partnerships with Native Hawaiian Student Services
  – Ensure that BTH participants engage w/ NH-serving organizations, scholarships & services

• CCs always large part of BTH enrollment;
  – How to engage BTH students with academic support services
  – Re-focus BTH on CC/AA students?
  – Why are some campuses declining in participation? (LCC)

• FUNDING? New Initiatives

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
New Questions, New Directions

• Does College Degree provide employment stability?
  – Larger Q for PSE in general
    • Compare BTH Grads w/UH degree earners
  – Balancing Liberal Arts & Professional Focus
• Self-reported “stop outs” vs. NSC & UH confirmed
• More BTH emphasis on Career Development & Graduate Job Placement*

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
New Questions, New Directions

• Does BTH Campus Contact “high touch” result in increased degree completion?
  – How to define “High Touch”*

• Does BTH focus on enrolling or completing degrees
  • Analyze # of credits completed in last enrollment (w/gpa?)

• Add’l $ & Staff for CC-based Student Services (BTH)

• Re-engage with DHS re: ID “College Capable”
  – Address decline in CC (LCC) Participation
  – Allow for “College Prep” Math / English for Re-entry Students
New Questions, New Directions

• Re-engage with DHS/FTW Policy re: requiring full-time enrollment for every semester
  – Experiencing External Difficulties Impacting Academics
  – Initial semester for some re-entry students?
    • Allow part-time (9 credits) & Maintain BTH employment option for maximum of 1-2 semesters over

• How to Account for Impact of “VocRehab” /Temp. Disability BTH Participants?
New Questions, New Directions

• Workforce Development with “Vocational Certificates”?
• BTH/UH Structural Difficulties – New & Different Program)
  – BTH = “Degree Seeking” ≠ Certificate
  – Employment Training Center (early 2000-2002 excluded)
  – Re-engage with ETC & CC’s Certificate/Workforce Development Programs

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
New Qs, New Directions, New Data

- Req FTW Identify “VocRehab” BTH Participants (Privacy)
  - Reconsider Higher Ed Option / Outcomes for VocRehab
  - BTH Intake Data ID “VocRehab”
- DHS participation in DXP to determine if BTH families still utilize SNAP, Sec8, QUEST, (Privacy)
- Encourage DHS Analysis of General FTW/(Non-BTH) for Comparison
- Q: Will P20 Track 2nd Gen College attendance of BTH Participants’ youth?

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
Re-Think BTH Data Set

- Revise “BTH New Participant Form” – New Qs
- Clean/Back-fill data
  - “VocRehab” (Temp Disability)
  - New Database?
- Annual Degree Completion Query w/ IRAO/NSC
- Launch 2016 Survey; Repeat Q + New Q

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
InterGenerational Impact Bridge to Hope Graduate & Future Graduate!

www/hawaii.edu/bridgetohope
DXP Timeline

2009
- 3-Party Data Sharing MOU (DOE-UH-DLIR)

2010
- Enacted Act 41
- Data Sharing Across Agencies

2011
- Added Dept of Health & Dept of Human Services to Data Sharing MOU

2012
- Awarded Ho'okele Grant
- SLDS preliminary work:
  > HIPASS Project
  > KCAA Pilot Study
  > Preliminary Discussion with KSBE
  > HCAP Head Start Data Matching Pilot
  > WICHE Multi-State Data Exchange (HI, ID, OR, WA)

2013
- Early Learning Needs Assessment & Data Mapping
- Data Use & Literacy Training with Oregon Assistance
- Data Governance Policy & Process
- P20W Infrastructure Build

2025
- Goal: 55% of Hawai‘i’s working age adults have 2-year or 4-year college degrees

www.hawaii.edu/bridgetohope